

Code No. and Date Received	Name and Address of Applicant	Description and Location of Proposed Development
18/0185/LBC 20.03.2018	Revd M Parker St Michaels Vicarage Church Street Abertillery NP13 1DA	Remove war memorial plaque from inside wall of church building Christ Church Pantddu Road Aberbeeg

APPLICATION TYPE: Listed Building Consent

SITE AND DEVELOPMENT

Location: A memorial plaque fixed to the interior wall of the former church at Christchurch, Aberbeeg.

Site description: Grade II Listed Building Church consisting of large South Eastern tower, single bay nave with Northern and Southern aisles, and Northern and Southern transepts, chancel and North Eastern vestry wing. The external materials consist of rock faced stone, Welsh slate roof tiles with terracotta ridge tiles and cruciform finials.

Development: Listed Building Consent is sought for the removal of the war memorial plaque from the interior of the building, and its installation at another church in the same parish.

Materials: Slate plaque and stainless steel screws.

PLANNING HISTORY 2005 TO PRESENT

POLICY

LOCAL DEVELOPMENT PLAN

Site Allocation: The application site itself is located outside of settlement limits.

Policies: CW2 (Amenity) and CW15 (General Locational Constraints).

Cont....

Application No. 18/0185/LBC Continued

NATIONAL POLICY

Section 7 of Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 states:

“That under the control of works in respect of listed buildings, no person shall execute or cause to be executed any works for the demolition of a listed building or for its alteration or extension in any manner which would affect its character as a building of special architectural or historic interest, unless the works are authorised.”

Planning Policy Wales Edition 9 (November 2016) paragraph 6.5.11 states:

“For any development proposal affecting a listed building or its setting, the primary material consideration is the statutory requirement to have special regard to the desirability of preserving the building, its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses. The aim should be to find the best way to protect and enhance the special qualities of listed buildings, retaining them in sustainable use.”

Also, paragraph 6.5.12 states:

“Local planning authorities will determine applications for consent for the demolition of a listed building and for any works of alteration or extension which would affect its character as a building of special architectural or historic interest. Controls apply to all works, both external and internal, including fixtures and curtilage structures that would affect a building's special interest.”

TAN 24: The Historic Environment (May 2017) paragraph 5.9 states:

“The Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 requires any works of demolition, alteration and/or extension which would affect the character of a listed building to be authorised through the process of listed building consent. It is a criminal offence to carry out such works without consent, which should be sought from the local planning authority. When considering any applications for listed building consent, the local planning authority or the Welsh Ministers must have special regard to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses. Consent is not normally required for repairs, unless they involve changes that would affect the character of the listed building.”

Cont....

Application No. 18/0185/LBC Continued

Also, paragraph 5.12 states:

"Applicants for listed building consent are required to provide a heritage impact statement. This presents the results of a heritage impact assessment, which is a process designed to ensure that the significance of the building is taken into account in the development and design of proposals for change. Heritage impact assessment should be proportionate both to the significance of the listed building, and to the degree of change proposed, and the statement should provide enough information to allow the local planning authority to judge significance and impact when considering applications for listed building consent."

ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT ASSESSMENT

Did the application have to be screened for an EIA? No.

Was an EIA required? Not Applicable.

COAL MINING LEGACY

Is the site within an area where there are mining legacy issues? Not applicable due to the nature of the application.

CONSULTATION

Conservation & Design Officer - The loss of this recently erected plaque (Nov 2001) would not have a detrimental impact on the special significance of this church building.

ADVERTISEMENT

Extent of advertisement: The application was advertised in the press and a site notice was erected near the application site.

Response: Five letters of objection were received objecting to the removal of the plaque.

Summary of observations: The following objections were made:

1. The application has not been sufficiently advertised in the locality.
2. The removal of the plaque to another church outside the Caerphilly borough is unacceptable as no consultation has been undertaken with the Friends of Christchurch and the plaque was paid for by Caerphilly County Borough Council.

Cont....

Application No. 18/0185/LBC Continued

3. An act of remembrance is held by the Royal British Legion inside the Church every year.
4. Suggests alternative locations for the plaque in one of the nearby villages.
5. Comments on the inappropriateness of the intended location for the plaque as the plaque would only be available to view by appointment as services are not held weekly.
6. One of the four screws holding the plaque into the wall is badly rusted.
7. The determination of this application should be deferred until the Friends of Christchurch know the outcome of the sale of the building.

SECTION 17 CRIME AND DISORDER ACT

What is the likely effect of the determination of this application on the need for the Local Planning Authority to do all it reasonably can to prevent crime and disorder in its area?

There are no specific crime and disorder implications material to the determination of this application.

EU HABITATS DIRECTIVE

Does the development affect any protected wildlife species? No.

COMMUNITY INFRASTRUCTURE LEVY (CIL)

Is this development Community Infrastructure Levy liable? No.

ANALYSIS

Policies: The application has been determined in accordance with national guidance in planning policies. The main consideration in determination of this application is whether the removal of the slate grey war memorial plaque and its four steel screws from the north-western interior wall will have a detrimental impact on this grade II listed building.

In this respect the memorial plaque was fixed to the interior wall of the church for the commemoration service held on 11 November 2001 in honour of the men and women of the Aberbeeg area who lost their lives in conflict. Faculty Approval would have needed to have been sought in the usual way for its erection on this internal wall through the ecclesiastical exemption procedure with the Representative Body of the Church in Wales. It would not have come to this Local Planning Authority for determination.

Cont....

Application No. 18/0185/LBC Continued

Since the closure of the building as a designated place of worship, the building therefore no longer benefits from ecclesiastical exemption. Consequently it is therefore for this Local Planning Authority to determine this 'secular' application itself, as it only relates to works to the interior of the building.

Given that the former church is now redundant and is currently advertised for sale by the representative Body of the Church in Wales, there is now limited access to the memorial itself for future Acts of Remembrance and for the laying of wreaths, etc. The purpose of removing the memorial plaque from the interior of this building is to relocate it to a place of worship within the same Parish as Christchurch so that the memorial plaque can remain on public display and so that Acts of Remembrance can continue to honour the war dead.

Whilst the memorial plaque is to be sited within a place of worship within the same Parish as the former Christchurch, unfortunately, the Church Parish Boundaries do not correlate with the County Borough administrative boundaries. In that regard the plaque would be moved from a building within Caerphilly County Borough to a church within Blaenau Gwent County Borough. However, where the plaque is to be sited and in which building in an adjoining authority, is not a matter for consideration in the determination of a Listed Building Application.

In terms of the proposal itself, the Conservation and Design officer has raised no objection to the proposal as the works proposed are considered to be minor in nature and would have no significant impact on the special architectural or historical interest of the building, subject to the four screw holes within the mortar of the interior wall are made good. This can be dealt with by the imposition of a condition imposed to the permission. On this basis, the application for Listed Building Consent is recommended for approval.

Comments from consultees: No objections raised.

Comments from public:

1. The application has not been sufficiently advertised in the locality - The extent of the advertisement in terms of this application has been discussed within this report. All publicity requirements have been met relating to the nature of the application.
2. The removal of the plaque to another church outside the Caerphilly borough is unacceptable as no consultation has been undertaken with the Friends of Christchurch and the plaque was paid for Caerphilly County Borough Council - This is not a material planning consideration in the determination of this application.

Cont....

Application No. 18/0185/LBC Continued

3. An act of remembrance is held by the Royal British Legion inside the Church every year - The proposal to relocate the memorial plaque is to ensure that Act of Remembrance services can continue.
4. Suggests alternative locations for the plaque in one of the nearby villages - This is a private matter for the Friends of Christchurch and the applicant to discuss.
5. Comments on the inappropriateness of the intended location for the plaque as the plaque would only be available to view by appointment as services are not held weekly - As stated previously in the above report, where the plaque is to be sited and in which building is not a matter for consideration in the determination of a Listed Building Application.
6. One of the four screws holding the plaque into the wall is badly rusted - This is not a material planning consideration.
7. The determination of this application should be deferred until the Friends of Christchurch know the outcome of the sale of the building - It is not considered reasonable or necessary to defer this application as the application can be determined on the information submitted, all other reasons for deferring the application are not material planning considerations.

Other material considerations:

The duty to improve the economic, social, environmental and cultural well-being of Wales, has been considered in accordance with the sustainable development principle, under section 3 of the Well-Being of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015. In reaching the recommendation below, the ways of working set out at section 5 of that Act have been taken into account, and it is considered that the recommendation is consistent with the sustainable development principle as required by section 8 of that Act.

RECOMMENDATION that Permission be GRANTED

This permission is subject to the following condition(s)

- 01) The works hereby permitted shall be begun before the expiry of five years from the date of this permission.
REASON: To comply with the provisions of Section 18 of the Town and Country Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990.

Cont....

Application No. 18/0185/LBC Continued

- 02) Notwithstanding the Listed Building Consent hereby approved, following removal of the war memorial plaque, all four screw holes in the mortar should be subsequently filled in and re-pointed with an appropriate lime based render and the wall made good.

REASON: To enforce the Local Planning Authority's statutory duty to have special regard to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses, and for the proper management of the historic environment.

Advisory Note(s)

The following policy(ies) of the Caerphilly County Borough Local Development Plan up to 2021 - Adopted November 2010 is/are relevant to the conditions of this permission: CW2 and CW15.

